Case: 1:14-cv-01046-JG Doc #: 15-13 Filed: 05/22/14 1 of 8. PageID #: 603

EXHIBIT M

Case: 1:14-cv-01046-JG Doc #: 15-13 Filed: 05/22/14 2 of 8. PageID #: 604



October 1, 2012

Associate Dean for Student Affairs

10900 Euclid Avenue Cleveland, Ohio 44106-4966

Visitors and Deliveries School of Medicine Room E421

> Phone 216.368.2212 Fax 216.368.8597 E-mail rxh31@case.edu

MEDICAL STUDENT PERFORMANCE EVALUATION FOR

Amir A. Al-Dabagh

Mr. Amir A. Al-Dabagh is a fourth-year student at Case Western Reserve University School of Medicine in Cleveland, Ohio. The attached appendix (Appendix A) contains detailed information regarding our curriculum.

ACADEMIC HISTORY

Date of Expected Graduation:

Date of Matriculation:

• Extensions, Leave of Absence:

Dual Danier (Cambinal Danier Chalante

Dual Degree/Combined Degree Students:

Type of Other Degree Program:

o Date of Initial Matriculation in Other Degree Program:

o Date of Expected Graduation from Other Degree Program:

Repeated Courses, Adverse Actions:

Not applicable

Research: July 2012

May 2014 July 2009

to July 2013

Not applicable

ACADEMIC PROGRESS

UNDERGRADUATE SCHOOL

Mr. Al-Dabagh entered the University of Michigan as a sophomore, due to AP credits, and graduated four years later with a triple major in Honors Biology (BS), Molecular Biology (BS), and Interpersonal Communications (BA) and a minor in Chemistry, while maintaining a GPA of 4.0. During these years, he was awarded various honors including Michigan Scholar Award, William J. Branstorm Award (top 5% of class), and James B. Angell Scholar (9 terms of all A's). He was featured in M-Livecampus news as one of five siblings to receive the Maize and Blue Award, the most prestigious award at the University of Michigan.

FOUNDATION OF MEDICINE AND HEALTH / FOUNDATIONS OF CLINICAL MEDICINE PROGRAM Mr. Amir A. Al-Dabagh's performance in the basic science curriculum in the first two years is evaluated on a pass/fail basis. There is no calculation of class rank. His performance in the Foundations of Medicine and Health and the Foundations of Clinical Medicine Program met expectations in all respects. Representative comments from faculty include: "Amir was an active participant in small group settings; always willing to take a leadership role, as well as, share knowledge with his colleagues. Early on, in a clinical setting, Amir made excellent progress with initial exposure." "Amir showed good clinical reasoning for his level and worked as a team member during his rotation."

CLINICAL CLERKSHIPS

BASIC CORE I (University Hospitals Veteran's Affairs Medical Center)

<u>Internal Medicine</u>: **Commendable.** Amir did an excellent job as a third year clerk on his Internal Medicine rotation. In calculation of a final clerkship grade the student's clinical performance accounts for 75% of the grade and the final 25% comes from the student's performance on the National Medical Board shelf exam. Amir was assigned to our inpatient hematology oncology service and then our inpatient general

medicine service where the attendings and residents had high regard for his PATIENT CARE efforts. As his mentors described, "Amir did a great job obtaining pertinent history and performing a complete physical exam on his patients. He was able to develop comprehensive differential diagnoses and even came up with care plans beyond his current level of training." "Amir did an excellent job interviewing a sometimes difficult patient and showed good concern for patient comfort." "Amir was very knowledgeable and his thought process was actually in line with what I would expect from a 4th year medical student. He was able to begin integrating the information he collected into the daily treatment plans and then he was able to generate an appropriate differential diagnosis list for the patients that he worked up." COMMUNICATION efforts both with medical colleagues as well as with patients and their families were well done. These comments support Amir's ability to communicate effectively. "Amir demonstrated great communication with patients, families and consultants. "Amir presented well on rounds and produced an excellent written summary of extensive records from an outside institution." "Amir did a good job presenting a patient based topic to the team. He was well prepared and efficient, highlighting the important elements of the story and the physical exam." As for PROFESSIONALISM, Amir's mentors remarked that he was "bright", "caring", "eager", "hardworking", "dependable" and "a team player". "Amir is professional with patients and team members. He treated all staff (nursing, social worker, team members) with respect." In summary, Amir had a strong performance during his Internal Medicine rotation as well as an excellent performance on the medicine shelf examination. It is our pleasure to award a final grade of COMMENDABLE to Amir for his work during the Internal Medicine Clerkship.

<u>Surgery</u>: **Commendable.** Amir is an excellent student, eager to learn, and always made himself available to help. He knows his patients very well, monitors the labs and images and continuously updates the corresponding resident. He is an excellent help in the OR. He gets along very well with all the surgical team, medical staff, and attendings. Amir is exceptionally compassionate with patients and families. He will make an excellent physician.

BASIC CORE II (University Hospitals Veteran's Affairs Medical Center)

<u>Family Medicine</u>: **Honors.** Preceptor's evaluation shows that Mr. Al-Dabagh demonstrated an outstanding ability to provide conscientious patient care and self-directed learning. His preceptor wrote, "Amir has been a pleasure to work with during these weeks. He conducts himself professionally and treats all patients and staff with respect and care. He arrives on time and is willing to spend extra time to help out and to further his learning. Not only does he have a strong fund of medical knowledge, he also asks excellent questions and is always eager to learn and research more. He has also been able to diagnose dermatological diseases that I was unsure of, supporting his reasoning with textbooks and peer-reviewed articles. I would be delighted to work with Amir in the future and am confident that he will make an excellent family physician." Preceptor evaluations gave this student outstanding ratings in all aspects of his clinical performance. With such fine clinical and interpersonal skills, as well as a strong knowledge base, this student will develop into an outstanding, caring physician.

Obstetrics/Gynecology: Commendable. Amir did well on his Ob/Gyn clerkship. His outpatient preceptor noted that Amir explained the procedure for speculum/pelvic exam to patient prior to beginning of exam, explained each step while performing an exam. By the third speculum exam, he was performing it independently and with high skill level. He made the patient comfortable during an exam, made good suggestions regarding birth control methods, answered patient's questions in detail using appropriate terminology. On gynecology, Amir did really well helping in the OR. He was always willing to help. He also responded well to feedback and improved his medical knowledge base. He gave an excellent presentation to the gynecology team and exhibited good speaking skills. He had good hand - eye coordination and suturing ability. Amir is confident in whatever he does and was helpful to the team. On L&D, an attending noted that Amir did a good job on night call. He does complete and thoughtful presentations, and connects with patients. He helped the team in triage and always asked well thought out questions. On MFM, he interacted well with the team & was polite/mannerly. By end of the week he was able to master basics of the particulars of his high-risk OB patients he followed.

<u>Pediatrics</u>: **Satisfactory.** Amir gave a very good performance during his Core Pediatric Clerkship at Rainbow Babies and Children's Hospital. His outpatient preceptor described him as eager, energetic, and intelligent. He related well to patients and parents, consistently putting them at ease. He was professional

in his interactions with office staff and met all expectations in the clinic setting. On the inpatient wards, one of the subspecialty attendings noted his outstanding fund of knowledge and applauded his presentations as organized, thorough, and confident. Amir made great efforts to engage his patients and to build rapport with them. He was consistently polite and respectful and, over the course of the month, solidified his role in the work flow for the team. He consistently reviewed cases in preparation for conferences, and earned an outstanding score on the pediatric shelf exam. Overall, this has been a SATISFACTORY performance in Pediatrics.

BASIC CORE III (University Hospitals Veteran's Affairs Medical Center)

<u>Neuroscience</u>: **Commendable**. Amir did a very good job on his Clinical Neuroscience rotation. He is detail-oriented, eager to learn, and eager to share what he learns with his fellow team members. His medical knowledge overall met expectations for his level of training, but he displayed a particularly strong knowledge of neuroanatomy. He willingly accepts and responds to feedback. He did an excellent presentation on critical care myopathy and neuropathy that benefitted his entire team. He is very likeable and interacts with patients and colleagues well. He shows great potential even this early in his medical training.

<u>Psychiatry</u>: **Commendable.** Mr. Al-Dabagh did good work in his psychiatry clerkship. He demonstrated concern for his patients by seeing them individually after team and assisting them with ambulation, etc. He learned a good deal of information about psychiatric diagnosis and treatment. His notes were concise and thorough. Mr. Al-Dabagh was quite proactive about presenting information to the team on topics that were pertinent to his patients. He behaved in a professional manner and treated the team with respect. He demonstrated an ability to review and synthesize the medical literature. Mr. Al-Dabagh demonstrated an understanding of the roles of the various treatment team members. He did an excellent job amassing information for a brief presentation on treatment resistant Schizophrenia.

Geriatrics: Scheduled to be completed November 15, 2013 Completed Emergency Medicine and Geriatrics Core rotations are graded as Achieves or Exceeds Competencies (AE).

Emergency Medicine: Scheduled to be completed September 20, 2013 Completed Emergency Medicine and Geriatrics Core rotations are graded as Achieves or Exceeds Competencies (AE).

ELECTIVES

<u>Dermatology</u> (Veteran's Affairs Center & University Hospitals) **Honors**. Amir did well during his Dermatology rotation. Comments from residents and faculty members with whom he worked included, "Amir was very pleasant to work with and very personable;" "Amir did an excellent oral presentation;" and "Amir seemed very interested in Dermatology." He gave an excellent presentation on scurvy at the end of his four-week rotation.

RESEARCH

Research has been an essential aspect in Mr. Al-Dabagh's undergraduate learning. Mr. Al-Dabagh has continued this practice into his medical career, publishing an article pertaining to the treatment of pemphigus and a case report during his three month research block with Case Western Reserve's dermatology department. Intrigued by these projects, Mr. Al-Dabagh dedicated a year to research and worked with the Center of Dermatology Research (CDR) under the leadership of Dr. Feldman and the faculty of Wake Forest's dermatology department. At the completion of the year, Mr. Al-Dabagh had 14 journal articles, 4 CME cases, and 4 book chapters published in journals ranging from Journal of the American Academy of Dermatology and American Journal of Clinical Dermatology to the Southern Medical Journal. Three additional papers are pending publication.

Of note, he wrote 3 books chapters in a Dermatopathology Primer for new dermatology residents, utilizing the James H. Graham, MD, & Gloria F. Graham, MD, Dermatopathology Library. His editorial about his medical relief trip to the Syrian border of Turkey was published in the Southern Medical Journal, whose editor wrote a supporting letter after he was moved by Mr. Al-Dabagh's message. In addition, Mr. Al-Dabagh has presented his work at international conferences in Scotland, Miami, Boston, Chicago, Orlando, and Chapel Hill, North Carolina and has been recognized in medical news a few times for his

Amir A. Al-Dabagh

4

work. He has experience with IRB submissions and protocols and collaborated with Wake Forest's psychiatry department, recruiting undergraduate students for an adherence study. Lastly, he has contributed to some journals (JAMA Dermatology, Psoriasis: Targets and Therapy, and Clinical, Cosmetic and Investigational Dermatology) as a peer reviewer.

UNIQUE CHARACTERISTICS

In addition to research, Mr. Al-Dabagh has particular interest in literature, international work, directing/singing, languages, and teaching. During his undergraduate years, he explored the various works of Shakespeare as well as other classical works and art, leading to various publications involving literary critiques and discussing gender roles. His concern about the international community inspired a thesis surrounding the past conflict in Albania and Serbia and ways to settle controversial international conflicts. Recently, Mr. Al-Dabagh spent a few weeks providing medical care and helping Syrian refuges in Turkey who has escaped the violence of their country. He has written about his experience and plans to continue more international medical work in the future.

During his research year (2012 – 2013) in North Carolina, Mr. Al-Dabagh dedicated some time to developing his artist talents. He co-directed an educational yet comical commercial for a contest hosted by the American Society of Dermatological Surgery with a dermatology resident in collaboration with Blackwing Media Group, an local studio. He also spent time developing his vocal talents and entered a singing competition in Winston Salem, NC, in which he reached the top 20. Mr. Al-Dabagh has been singing in Arabic and English within his local community from a young age. Lately, he has networked greatly within the music community in aspiration of pursuing a second career in the near future.

Mr. Al-Dabagh fluently reads, writes, and speaks in Arabic and also has reading and some spoken knowledge of the Spanish language. Moreover, his volunteerism has persisted throughout his medical school and research years, dedicating time to organizing social events, working at free clinics, and helping out at academic events. He organized a social event for the CDR at Havana 1957 in South Beach, Miami for over 25 guests at the American Academy of Dermatology conference. He volunteered to screen community members for skin diseases and cancer at the Share the Health Fair in Winston Salem, NC and annual community skin screenings at Wake Forest's Dermatology Department.

SUMMARY

In summary, Mr. Amir Al-Dabagh is a bright, hardworking, caring, senior medical student who has demonstrated consistent growth in his approach to his medical education. His performance in the core clinical clerkships has predominately fallen in the commendable range. Mr. Al-Dabagh possesses a solid knowledge base and growing clinical acumen including mature clinical judgment. His interpersonal skills are strong and he works well with patients and members of the healthcare team. It is a great pleasure to present Mr. Al-Dabagh to you as an excellent candidate for residency training.

ADDENDUM

<u>January 31, 2014</u>: At our Committee on Students' recommendation, this addendum is being added to Amir Al' Dabagh's medical student performance evaluation. Amir was presented to this committee on November 22, 2013 as a result of his medicine Al (acting internship) performance at University Hospitals of Cleveland. Our rotation grading is as follows: H (Honors,) C (Commendable), S (Satisfactory), U (Unsatisfactory), and Satisfactory with Concerns. Amir received a Satisfactory with Concerns as a result of issues raised by his attendings and other staff. Once Amir was made aware of these concerns, he did improve to the point of passing the rotation. However, given several earlier concerns, the Committee on Students recommended that Amir repeat the rotation and work on other corrective actions as outlined by one of our senior faculty members who sits on the Committee on Students. On the repeat of the acting internship, Amir again received a grade of passing with concerns, but he did show improvement compared to the first rotation.

Sincerely,

5

Teabling.

Robert Haynie, M.D., Ph.D. Associate Dean for Student Affairs Associate Clinical Professor Case Western Reserve University School of Medicine

RH:ss/sh

The School of Medicine will elect students from the Class of 2013 to the Alpha Omega Alpha Honor Medical Society in mid-November of 2012.

Appendix A Case Western Reserve University School of Medicine Curriculum Information Page, Class of 2014

Average length of enrollment (initial matriculation to graduation) of the M.D. track: 4.2 years

The Case School of Medicine curriculum for the Class of 2014 consists of the Foundations of Medicine and Health (FMH) and the Clinical Curriculum (CC).

The Foundations of Medicine and Health is the major component of the first two years and provides fundamental biomedical principles and knowledge of disease and illness mechanisms essential for all physicians. The curriculum is structured in an integrated interdisciplinary organ-system-based format, establishing the foundation necessary for students to fully engage in the clinical curriculum.

Foundations of Medicine and Health blocks (listed below) are completed in 18 months after matriculation:

Block 1: Becoming a Doctor

Social-Behavioral Determinants of Health

Civic Professionalism

Epidemiology/Biostatistics

Block 2: The Human Blueprint

Endocrinology

Reproductive Biology

Development Genetics

Molecular Biology Cancer Biology

Block 3: Food to Fuel

Biochemistry

Energy/Metabolism

Nutrition

Gastrointestinal System

Block 4: Homeostasis

Cell Physiology Pharmacology

Cardiovascular Physiology

Renal Physiology Pulmonary Physiology

Block 5: Host Defense and Host Response

Immunology

Hematology/Oncology

Rheumatology

Microbiology/Infectious Diseases

Dermatology

Block 6: Cognition, Sensation and Movement

Neurosciences Psychiatry

Musculoskeletal System

Block 7: Structure—Longitudinal throughout Blocks 1 – 6: Anatomy, Histopathology, and Radiology

Block 8: Foundations of Clinical Medicine Program (FCM) - Longitudinal throughout Blocks 1-6:

- Tuesday Seminars Years 1 and 2: weekly 2-hour seminars combining small and large group teaching methods, continuing the theme of "doctoring" begun in Block 1.
- o Communication in Medicine Workshops Years 1 and 2: total of 7 workshops.
- o Rotating Apprenticeships in Medical Practices (RAMP) Year 1: students rotate through a variety of patient care experiences, observing health care across many different settings.
- Community Patient Care Preceptorship (CPCP) Year 1 after completion of RAMP: students work in a clinic setting with a physician preceptor for a semester.
- Physical Diagnosis Program:
 - o PD1 Year 1: introduction to the basic adult exam; 1 session per week for 11 weeks.
 - o PD2 Years 1 and 2: in-depth regional exams.
 - o PD3 Year 2: Complete H&P and write-up of 5 patients.

The Clinical Curriculum starts after the completion of FMH and is divided into 4 areas:

1. <u>Basic Core Rotations</u>: Beginning in March or July of their second year, students start their core clinical rotations: Basic Core I (Internal Medicine, Family Medicine, and Geriatrics), Basic Core II (Obstetrics/Gynecology, Pediatrics), Basic Core III (Neuroscience, Psychiatry), and Basic Core IV (Surgery and Emergency Medicine) in two 12-week blocks and two 8-week blocks, respectively. Clinical experiences are integrated across disciplines whenever possible.

- 2. <u>Research Block</u>: Every student completes a 16-week research block, conducting Basic Science, Clinical, or Epidemiologic/Health Services Research. This work forms the foundation of their M.D. thesis, which is a graduation requirement.
- 3. <u>Acting Internships</u>: Students are required to do a minimum of 2 Acting Internships. One of the Als must be in Internal Medicine, Surgery, Pediatrics, or Family Medicine.
- 4. <u>Electives</u>: Students are required to complete 22 weeks of clinical electives and up to 14 additional weeks of electives (clinical or non-clinical) during their final year.

Description of the Evaluation System used at the medical school:

- 1. In the first two years, a pass/fail grading system is used, and no class rank is assigned.
- 2. Passage of USMLE Step 1, Step 2 CK, and Step 2 CS is a graduation requirement.
- 3. Students must complete a mandatory reflective portfolio after years one and two of medical school. The student is responsible for crafting essays that detail evidence for meeting the nine core competencies of our school: Medical Knowledge, Patient Care, Interpersonal and Communication Skills, Professionalism, Life-long Learning and Personal Development, Research and Scholarship, Civic Professionalism and Leadership, Practice-based Learning and Improvement, Systems-based Practice. The portfolio is evaluated as either Meets or Does Not Meet Expectations.
- 4. Performance in the Basic Core Clinical Rotations, Electives, and Acting Internships is graded as Honors, Commendable, Satisfactory, or Unsatisfactory. Completed Emergency Medicine and Geriatrics Core rotations are graded as Achieves or Exceeds Competencies (AE).
- 5. The medical school does not mandate a particular distribution of clinical grades.
- 6. Successful completion of an Objective/Observed Structured Evaluation or Clinical Skills Exam (CSE) is required after Years 1 and 2 and during Year 4.
- 7. The M.D. thesis is a graduation requirement and must be submitted by January 15 of the graduation year. The thesis is reviewed by a faculty committee and evaluated as either Meets or Does Not Meet Expectations. A select number of students may earn a distinction in research that is awarded at graduation.
- 8. The MSPE is prepared by Deans Robert Haynie, M.D., Ph.D., Associate Dean for Student Affairs; Lynda Montgomery, M.D., M.Ed., Assistant Dean for Student Societies; Steven Ricanati, M.D., Assistant Dean for Student Societies; and Charles Kent Smith, M.D., Senior Associate Dean for Students. The Deans work with each student in a learning-community format over the student's entire time at the school.
- 9. Summative clinical comments in the MSPE are edited for length and grammar, but not content.
- 10. Students are permitted to review the MSPE in the Student Affairs office prior to its transmission.